

## **Sustainability Study – Nackawic School Financial Considerations**

In order to do some financial comparisons, we need to consider the “What If” scenarios that would be most likely if the District Education Council voted in favor of closing one or more schools and the Minister of Education and Early Childhood Development approved the movement of students to another location. The three “What If” scenarios for this particular study are:

- A) Move students from Nackawic Middle School to Nackawic High School, resulting in a 6-12 school.
- B) Move students from Nackawic Elementary School to Nackawic Middle School, resulting in a K-8 school.
- C) Move students from Nackawic Elementary School to Nackawic Middle School, resulting in a K-8 school that would also include students from Millville Elementary School.

### **Staffing Information and Implications**

- Teacher staffing is conducted based on a series of formulas that are related to student enrolment.
- In reviewing the numbers to assign staff for 2015-16, we used enrollment from the Spring of 2015.
- Classroom FTE (Full Time Equivalent; number of teachers) is assigned by formula, knowing that there is a maximum class size for classrooms as indicated in the Teacher’s Collective Agreement
  - 1.1 FTE per classroom at the elementary level
  - 1.2 FTE per classroom at the middle level
  - 1.0 FTE per 12.4 students for first 100 at high school level (minimum 5.0 FTE)
  - 1.0 FTE per 19.7 students for next 300 at high school level
- Guidance FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 502 students (topped up where it can be).
- Resource FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 180 students (topped up where it can be).
- Administration FTE is assigned at 1.0 FTE per 275 students (topped up where it can be).
- The number of school administrators is assigned according to the number of teachers; 1 principal is provided to a school with less than 12.6 FTE, 1 principal and 1 vice-principal is provided to a school with 12.6 FTE or more, but less than 37.6 FTE.
- Top-ups in FTE are assessed year to year.
- Education Assistants are assigned based on need and on an annual basis.

- Library Assistants are assigned based on a formula of 1.0 per 870 students; it is based on a 36.25 hour work week, so part time library assistants are most common (there are times when a public library is within the school and a Library Assistant is not under Education).
- Administrative Assistants are assigned at a minimum of one full-time per school (36.25 hours per week), with top-up for larger schools. One full-time administrative assistant works 12 months per year at each high school setting. The remainder work 10 months per year.
- Custodial Staff are assigned based on square footage of the facility.
- All staff are paid based on scales within their collective agreements.
- Principals and vice-principals are paid a responsibility allowance (based on enrolment and years of experience in the position).
- Please see Appendix A for data on staff.
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario A:
  - \$13 259 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs
  - \$7 158 due to 5.75 hrs/week less library assistant (0.16 FTE), including employer costs
  - \$33 736 due to 1.0 less administrative assistant, including employer costs
  - \$101 109 due to 2.5 less custodian, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario A is **\$155 262**
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario B:
  - \$7 752 due to one less principal at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs and taking into account resulting medium sized school
  - \$19 777 due to 0.59 less administrative assistant, including employer costs
  - \$61 090 due to 1.45 less custodian, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario B is **\$88 619**
- Annual savings due to staffing process for Scenario C:
  - \$21 011 due to two less principals at Year 3, Small School, including employer costs and taking into account resulting medium sized school
  - \$149 487 due to 2.2 less FTE at Year 5, Certificate 5, including employer costs
  - \$50 881 due to 1.59 less administrative assistant, including employer costs
  - \$85 250 due to 2.1 less custodian, including employer costs
- Total annual savings for staff for Scenario C is **\$306 629**

### Global School Budgets and Operational Facility Budgets

- Global school budgets and Operational Facility Budgets are assigned on an annual basis according to a number of different formulas. Enrolment is often a key factor. They are used to support student learning and operate the facility.
- Since amalgamation, we have adjusted school budgets to ensure that significant decreases do not occur all at once, if a decrease is required; we ensure that any budget reductions do not go further than 2.5% (likewise, if it grows, we cap at 2.5%). If this were not to be in place, the global budgets based on our enrolment and formulas would have yielded a variety of different amounts:
  - Nackawic Elementary School would have had an increase of 11% and they ended up with an increase of 2.4% (after adjustments made for all schools).
  - Nackawic Middle School would have had a decrease of 16% and they ended up with a decrease of only 2.5%
  - Nackawic High School would have had a decrease of 19% and they ended up with a decrease of only 2.5%.
  - Millville Elementary School would have had a decrease of 44% and they ended up with a decrease of only 2.5%
- Please see Appendix B for details on global school budgets and facility operational budgets for potential annual savings; this is data as projected by our Budget and Accounting Team.
- Total annual savings from global school budgets and facility operational budgets are:
  - Scenario A – \$105 316
  - Scenario B – \$83 095
  - Scenario C - \$116 497

### Transportation Costs

Scenario A & B would see no change in transportation practices. No change in cost... \$0.

Scenario C would see the reduction of the two current bus runs in the Millville Elementary School catchment area for Millville Elementary School. This would give rise to an approximate annual savings of \$17 000.

### Capital Improvement Avoidance

- Schools have a number of projects listed on the Capital Improvement Project database. Each year, a number of projects are prioritized and submitted to government for approval.
- If a school were to close, the projects would then not be necessary and be removed from the list for consideration.
- Projects vary in terms of priority/need; some are necessary in a timely manner and some are not; some projects may be for aesthetic improvement as well.

- Estimates for projects are based on formulas and historic costs – they are estimates and not actual quotes; the Department of Education and Early Childhood Development and the Department of Transportation and Infrastructure are involved in capital construction projects.
- The capital improvements currently on the list for Nackawic Elementary School include:
  - Installing automatic door openers on the exterior doors (accessibility)
  - Some window replacements
  - An upgrading to the bus/parent drop off zone at the rear of the building
  - Electrical transformer cleaning
- These projects amount to approximately \$280 000.
- The capital improvements currently on the list for Nackawic Middle School include:
  - Automatic door openers and exterior door replacements
  - Brick re-pointing
  - Refinishing of metal siding
  - Window replacement
  - Roof recapping and repairs
  - Driveway repairs
  - Paving
  - Floor replacements
  - Upgrading of air handling units in the office end of the school
- These projects amount to approximately \$630 000.
- The capital improvements currently on the list for Millville Elementary School include:
  - Roof replacement work
  - Siding replacement
  - Paving
  - Some window replacement
  - Wheel chair lift and automatic door openers
  - Floor replacements
  - Office relocation
  - Intercom System upgrades
  - Backflow prevention for water supply and distribution
  - Electrical panel upgrades
  - Ventilation system and electrical upgrade
- These projects amount to approximately \$836 900.



### Facility Improvements Required Should a Move Occur

It is recognized that should Scenario A, B, or C occur, then there will need to be an investment made into the building that is hosting new students.

#### Scenario A

Would an extension to the building (Nackawic High School) be required to allow for hosting students in Grades 6 to 12? The internal portion of the building would not require modifications as the middle school students would be capable of using the same facilities as the high school students currently use. At this time, four classrooms are not suitable for use and the Grade 9 to 12 classes are shifted around elsewhere, including the use of the cafeteria for one classroom setting. At first glance, a functional capacity rating of 68.4% would suggest that there would be room. However, a space utilization study would suggest that the space in the school is being used appropriately for a high school setting, without a lot of room to spare. It could be that if the school were to remain as a 9-12 school, they could manage without three classrooms. If the school were to house middle level students in Grades 6 to 8, seven additional classroom spaces would be required, meaning the wing would need to be repaired and four additional classrooms would be required. The cost of adding four classrooms, as a permanent addition, is estimated to be \$1 million.

#### Scenario B

The middle school would require some modifications to support the elementary students. The middle school presently has 17 classroom spaces. The middle school would require 7 spaces next year and the elementary would require 11 spaces. This would represent the need for an additional 1 space as a classroom. The cost of this could vary depending on if we could use another room within the school (not defined as a classroom) (minimal cost), dividing a larger classroom into two (\$3 500), or add a modular classroom (\$120 000).

Modifications to consider for the existing school would be:

- Water fountain and washroom modifications – lower the water fountains to accommodate K-5 students and adjust the urinals in the male washrooms. (minimal, perhaps \$2 500 if improvements made)
- Smartboards may need to be lowered or installed at a height appropriate for K-1 grade levels. (minimal costs to lower existing units)
- Removal of the lockers and install coat hooks (\$22 000 for coat and boot racks as per DTI/EECD guidelines)
- Gym basketball nets – change out the backboards to accommodate lowering for elementary level (\$3 600)
- Relocation of smartboards, fm systems, would be coming from the existing school (could carry \$3 300 for \$300/classroom for connections and installation costs)
- Relocation of existing school furniture and resource materials (\$4 000)

Playground consideration: the equipment has been in the ground for at least 15 years. The manufacturer does not appear to be in business any longer. With this being said and from the experiences we have recently had it is not recommended that the playground be considered for relocation. Experience would show that it is possible the posts, platforms, slides and brackets will not fit when putting it back together. It is possible during the demolition of the existing playground that some pieces will break or be damaged and it is not possible to get the replacement parts. Once the equipment is relocated it is necessary to have it meet the current CSA standard. It is likely that new playground equipment would be required. This cost is minimally \$80 000 (the amount assigned by the Province when a new school is constructed), and could be more based on the desires of the school community. Playground equipment purchases traditionally come from fundraising (outside a new school allotment).

### Scenario C

The middle school would require some modifications to support the elementary students. The middle school presently has 17 classroom spaces. The middle school classes would require 7 spaces next year and the elementary school classes would require 12 spaces. This would represent the need for an additional 2 spaces as classrooms. The cost of this could vary depending on if we could use other rooms within the school (not defined as a classroom) (minimal cost), dividing a larger classroom into two (\$3 500) per room, or adding one modular classroom (\$120 000) or two modular classrooms \$135 000.

Modifications to consider for the existing school would be:

- Water fountain and washroom modifications – lower the water fountains to accommodate K-5 students and adjust the urinals in the male washrooms. (minimal, perhaps \$2 500 if improvements made)
- Smartboards may need to be lowered or installed at a height appropriate for K-1 grade levels. (minimal costs to lower existing units)
- Removal of the lockers and install coat hooks (\$24 000 for coat and boot racks as per DTI/EECD guidelines)
- Gym basketball nets – change out the backboards to accommodate lowering for elementary level (\$3 600)
- Relocation of smartboards, fm systems, would be coming from the existing school (could carry \$3 600 for \$300/classroom for connections and installation costs)
- Relocation of existing school furniture and resource materials (\$5 000)



Playground consideration: the equipment at Nackawic Elementary has been in the ground for at least 15 years. The manufacturer does not appear to be in business any longer. With this being said and from the experiences we have recently had it is not recommended that the playground be considered for relocation. Experience would show that it is possible the posts, platforms, slides and brackets will not fit when putting it back together. It is possible during the demolition of the existing playground that some pieces will break or be damaged and it is not possible to get the replacement parts. Once the equipment is relocated it is necessary to have it meet the current CSA standard. It is likely that new playground equipment would be required. This cost is minimally \$80 000 (the amount assigned by the Province when a new school is constructed), and could be more based on the desires of the school community. Playground equipment purchases traditionally come from fundraising (outside a new school allotment). It is unknown if playground equipment would be moved from Millville Elementary School.

#### **TOTAL ANNUAL SAVINGS**

- SCENARIO A – \$260 578 (Nackawic High becomes a 6-12 school, Nackawic Elementary status quo)
- SCENARIO B – \$171 714 (Nackawic Middle becomes a K-8 school, Nackawic High status quo)
- SCENARIO C – \$440 126 (Nackawic Middle becomes a K-8 school with Millville included, Nackawic High status quo)

#### **ONE-TIME COST AVOIDANCE**

- SCENARIO A – \$630 000 (because Nackawic Middle School as a building would close)
- SCENARIO B – \$280 000 (because Nackawic Elementary School as a building would close)
- SCENARIO C – \$1 116 900 (because Nackawic Elementary School and Millville Elementary School would both close)

#### **ONE-TIME EXPENSES**

- SCENARIO A – \$1 000 000 (not including repairs to current wing)
- SCENARIO B – \$115 400 (without a modular classroom) to \$235 400 (with a modular classroom)
- SCENARIO C – \$118 700 (without a modular classroom) to \$253 700 (with a modular classroom)

NOTE: A permanent expansion to the middle schools would cost several hundred thousand dollars more.

- Please note: A principal and vice-principal is hired for a five year term. Should a school close and the principal and/or vice-principal not retire, resign or assume another school position of responsibility within the district, the employee continues to earn the responsibility allowance with the new assignment for the remainder of his or her five year term. The expectation is that the employee will still contribute in a leadership capacity within the new assignment. The future assignments for the principals/vice-principals of these particular schools are not be known at this time of the study.

# Appendix A

Grades - Enrollment	K	1	2	3	4	5	3EFL	4EFL	5EFL	6	7	8	6EFL	7EFL	8EFL	6LFI	7LFI	8LFI	9	10	11	12	9FI	10FI	11FI	12FI	Total
2015-16																											
Nackawic Elementary School	24	38	41	15	16	15	17	21	21																		208
Nackawic Middle School										24	29	27	13	13	20	14	0	7									147
Nackawic High School																			44	55	49	50	25	11	15	15	264
Millville Elementary School (MES)	1	4	3	9	7	5																					29
2016-17 Projections																											
Nackawic Elementary School	31	24	38	19	15	16	22	17	21																		203
Nackawic Middle School										20	24	29	21	13	13	0	14	0									134
Nackawic High School																			37	44	55	49	27	25	11	15	263
Millville Elementary School	4	1	4	3	9	7																					28
2016-17 Projections																											
Nackawic Elementary School	31	24	38	19	15	16	22	17	21																		203
Nackawic 6-12 School										20	24	29	21	13	13	0	14	0	37	44	55	49	27	25	11	15	397
2016-17 Projections																											
Nackawic K-8 School (w/o MES)	31	24	38	19	15	16	22	17	21																		337
Nackawic High School																			37	44	55	49	27	25	11	15	263
2016-17 Projections																											
Nackawic K-8 School (with MES)	35	25	42	22	24	23	22	17	21																		365
Nackawic High School																			37	44	55	49	27	25	11	15	263

H5 Grey - Assumes 10 from K/VMS

	K-5 FTE	6-8 FTE	9-12 FTE	Admin	Guide	Res	Total FTE	Actl FTE	Fct Cpy	EA	LA	AA	Clean
2015-16													
Nackawic Elementary School	13.20			0.76	0.41	1.16	15.53	15.40	66.7	3.00	0.24	1.00	2.20
Nackawic Middle School		9.60		0.53	0.29	0.82	11.24	11.20	29.8	5.00	0.16	1.00	2.50
Nackawic High School			16.39	0.96	0.53	1.47	19.35	19.75	45.5	4.00	N/A	1.82	3.53
Millville Elementary School (MES)	3.30			0.11	0.06	0.16	3.63	4.00	30.2	0.00	0.03	1.00	0.65
2016-17 Projections													
Nackawic Elementary School	12.10			0.74	0.40	1.13	14.37		65.1	3.00	0.23	1.00	2.20
Nackawic Middle School		8.40		0.49	0.27	0.74	9.90		27.2	5.00	0.15	1.00	2.50
Nackawic High School			16.34	0.96	0.52	1.46	19.28		45.3	4.00	N/A	1.82	3.53
Millville Elementary School	3.30			0.10	0.06	0.16	3.62		29.2	0.00	0.03	1.00	0.65
2016-17 Projections													
Nackawic Elementary School	12.10			0.74	0.40	1.13	14.37		65.1	3.00	0.23	1.00	2.20
Nackawic 6-12 School		8.40	16.34	1.44	0.79	2.21	29.18		68.4	9.00	N/A	1.82	3.53
2016-17 Projections													
Nackawic K-8 School (w/o MES)	12.10	8.40		1.23	0.67	1.87	24.27		76.2	8.00	0.39	1.41	3.25
Nackawic High School			16.34	0.96	0.52	1.46	19.28		45.3	4.00	N/A	1.82	3.53
2016-17 Projections													
Nackawic K-8 School (with MES)	13.20	8.40		1.33	0.73	2.03	25.69		82.6	8.00	0.42	1.41	3.25
Nackawic High School			16.34	0.96	0.52	1.46	19.28		45.3	4.00	N/A	1.82	3.53

FTE = Full Time Equivalent  
Admin = Administration  
Guide = Guidance  
Res = Resource  
Actl FTE = Actual FTE Assigned  
Fct Cpy = Functional Capacity  
EA = Educational Assistant  
LA = Library Assistant  
AA = Administrative Assistant  
Clean = Cleaning Staff

over staffed



## Estimated Cost Summary Based on Scenarios

### 2015-16

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Nackawic Elementary	25,778.76	89,021.00	114,799.76
Nackawic Middle	18,842.58	109,706.00	128,548.58
Nackawic High	36,987.76	157,960.00	194,947.76
Millville Elementary	8,857.52	33,416.00	42,273.52
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>90,466.62</b>	<b>390,103.00</b>	<b>480,569.62</b>

### 2016-17 Status Quo

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Nackawic Elementary	25,945.19	89,049.00	114,994.19
Nackawic Middle	18,371.51	109,716.00	128,087.51
Nackawic High	36,063.07	158,143.00	194,206.07
Millville Elementary	8,636.08	33,537.00	42,173.08
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>89,015.85</b>	<b>390,445.00</b>	<b>479,460.85</b>

### 2016-17 Scenario A

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Nackawic Elementary	25,945.19	89,049.00	114,994.19
Nackawic 6-12	54,434.60	162,543.00	216,977.60
Millville Elementary	8,636.08	33,537.00	42,173.08
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>89,015.87</b>	<b>285,129.00</b>	<b>374,144.87</b>

### 2016-17 Scenario B

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Nackawic K-8 (w/o MV)	44,270.38	115,716.00	159,986.38
Nackawic High	36,063.12	158,143.00	194,206.12
Millville Elementary	8,636.08	33,537.00	42,173.08
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>88,969.58</b>	<b>307,396.00</b>	<b>396,365.58</b>

### 2016-17 Scenario C

School	Budget Costs	Facilities Costs	TOTAL
Nackawic K-8 (with MV)	52,141.91	116,616.00	168,757.91
Nackawic High	36,063.17	158,143.00	194,206.17
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>88,205.08</b>	<b>274,759.00</b>	<b>362,964.08</b>

# School Budget and Facilities Cost Scenarios

## 2015-16 Budget

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Nackawic Elementary	17,752.54	4,380.50	922.21	674.21	2,049.30	25,778.76
Nackawic Middle	14,184.62	3,500.10	736.86	421.00	-	18,842.58
Nackawic High	27,867.47	6,876.39	1,447.66	796.24	-	36,987.76
Millville Elementary	6,440.72	1,589.27	334.58	122.03	370.92	8,857.52

## 2016-17 Budget Status Quo

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Nackawic Elementary	17,979.45	4,436.49	934.00	645.12	1,950.13	25,945.19
Nackawic Middle	13,795.01	3,403.96	716.62	455.92	-	18,371.51
Nackawic High	27,138.09	6,696.41	1,409.77	818.80	-	36,063.07
Millville Elementary	6,371.17	1,572.11	330.97	89.94	271.89	8,636.08

## 2016-17 Budget Scenario A

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Nackawic Elementary	17,979.45	4,436.49	934.00	645.12	1,950.13	25,945.19
Nackawic 6-12	40,933.10	10,100.38	2,126.40	1,274.72	-	54,434.60

## 2016-17 Budget Scenario B

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Nackawic K-8 (w/o MV)	31,738.79	7,831.65	1,648.77	1,101.04	1,950.13	44,270.38
Nackawic High	27,138.09	6,696.41	1,409.77	818.85	-	36,063.12

## 2016-17 Budget Scenario C

School	Instructional P71100	Administration P72100	Co/Extra Trip P75200	PSSC P76100	Healthy Minds P73114	Total
Nackawic K-8 (with MV)	37,521.26	9,258.49	1,949.16	1,190.98	2,222.02	52,141.91
Nackawic High	27,138.09	6,696.41	1,409.77	818.90	-	36,063.17



### 2015-16 Facilities Costs Estimates

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Nackawic Elementary	56,951.00	12,576.00	3,428.00	8,021.00	-	2,814.00	5,231.00	89,021.00
Nackawic Middle	77,132.00	10,928.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	1,467.00	7,763.00	109,706.00
Nackawic High	118,894.00	13,309.00	4,868.00	9,375.00	-	3,266.00	8,248.00	157,960.00
Millville Elementary	4,578.00	-	2,412.00	7,725.00	12,544.00	1,375.00	4,782.00	33,416.00

### 2016-17 Budget Status Quo

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Nackawic Elementary	57,000.00	12,600.00	3,428.00	8,021.00	-	2,800.00	5,200.00	89,049.00
Nackawic Middle	77,000.00	11,000.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	1,500.00	7,800.00	109,716.00
Nackawic High	119,000.00	13,300.00	4,868.00	9,375.00	-	3,300.00	8,300.00	158,143.00
Millville Elementary	4,600.00	-	2,412.00	7,725.00	12,600.00	1,400.00	4,800.00	33,537.00

### 2016-17 Facilities Costs Estimates-Scenario A

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Nackawic Elementary	57,000.00	12,600.00	3,428.00	8,021.00	-	2,800.00	5,200.00	89,049.00
Nackawic 6-12	121,000.00	14,000.00	4,868.00	9,375.00	-	4,000.00	9,300.00	162,543.00

### 2016-17 Facilities Costs Estimates-Scenario B

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Nackawic K-8 (w/o MV)	80,000.00	12,000.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	2,500.00	8,800.00	115,716.00
Nackawic High	119,000.00	13,300.00	4,868.00	9,375.00	-	3,300.00	8,300.00	158,143.00

## 2016-17 Facilities Costs Estimates-Scenario C

School	Electricity	Water & Sewer	Garbage Removal	Ground Maintenance	Heating Fuel	Cleaning Supplies	Minor Repairs	Total
Nackawic K-8 (with MV)	80,500.00	12,200.00	3,041.00	9,375.00	-	2,600.00	8,900.00	116,616.00
Nackawic High	119,000.00	13,300.00	4,868.00	9,375.00	-	3,300.00	8,300.00	158,143.00